

MINUTES

2019 CITIZEN FINANCIAL REVIEW TASK FORCE

3600 Tremont Road | Upper Arlington, OH 43221 614-583-5030 | upperarlingtonoh.gov

6/5/2019 | 7:00 PM

The meeting of the Citizen Financial Review Task Force was called to order at 7:00 p.m. in the Lower Level Meeting Room, located at 3600 Tremont Road by Chairperson Ann Gabriel.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Chairperson Ann Gabriel, Jamie Crane, Colin Gawel, Greg

Guy, Tim Keen, Matthew Rule, Kaz Unalan

MEMBERS ABSENT: Ukeme Awakessien Jeter, Matthew Kirby

STAFF PRESENT: Assistant Deputy City Clerk Sherry Dean

1. Approval of Minutes of May 30, 2019 Meeting

Ms. Crane moved, seconded by Mr. Guy, to approve the minutes of the May 30, 2019 Citizen Financial Review Task Force Meeting.

Motion carried.

2. Discuss Responses to Charges from City Council

Undertake a high level assessment of existing service levels to verify alignment with community needs and/or expectations

Chair Gabriel opened the conversation for any further input on the level of existing services. There was no discussion.

Explore further privatization and/or collaboration opportunities

Chair Gabriel began with the Summary of Privatization & Shared Services (attached hereto and incorporated herein by reference as Exhibit A).

Mr. Guy said there could be opportunities for public private partnerships that are beneficial, and out of the box for the city. He conveyed he owns a business in the City of Dublin and is constantly courted by the city, however, some of his friends that have businesses based in Upper Arlington do not feel the same level of courtship. He conveyed he feels part of the City Manager's job is to court the business community. UA needs strong advocates and he feels this could be improved. He advised the City Manager of Dublin is helpful in determining what the city can do to advocate for his business.

Mr. Guy feels the City Manager should use the businesses in UA as their best opportunity to court other businesses. Mr. Gawel agreed, the best references are the businesses already in UA. Mr. Unalan added it is about having stronger relationships and encouraging the collaboration. Mr. Guy stated he would encourage the city administration to be an advocate for businesses because it is job creation and tax revenues.

Mr. Rule conveyed he was disappointed to see Ruscilli leave UA and questioned if there are ways to think more creatively. He recognized they do not have Grandview Yard or Bridge Park but they should be thinking how they can get there. He stated Upper Arlington needs to think at higher levels, and there is an opportunity to think more outside of the box.

Mr. Guy questioned if Upper Arlington participates in any employee engagement surveys. He advised the Village of Obetz just won an award for being a top workplace. He thinks it would be interesting to conduct an anonymous survey and see how they do. Mr. Keen related they went through the survey which was citizen oriented toward the community, but questioned if there is a survey of the businesses. From a business community perspective, they could put a note in the recommendations this is an area to think about, what more could the city do and is it in alignment with what the business community would like to see. Mr. Guy pointed out the city is one of the top five employers in Upper Arlington, and questioned how employees feel about working for the city, and if it is considered a top place to work.

Chair Gabriel said the Committee has been asked to explore privatization or collaboration opportunities. She stated two departments come to mind, IT and Human Resources (the compliance side of payroll compensation.) When inquiring about the payroll service, she was told there are some complexities in government, with unions, pension systems, etc. She stated all government entities have this issue, if there is not an existing service, maybe there is an opportunity to share this service.

Chair Gabriel remarked there are a lot of IT providers. Mr. Rule said there is a real opportunity there, from a quality perspective and the rapidly changing environment, it might be a better solution.

Mr. Guy stated as a father of four whose children play sports in UA, he needs to schedule field space, and he does not have an app. Mr. Gawel said currently they have no idea what is being used. Mr. Guy said there is no visibility and they have to call the field sports hotline to inquire if the fields are closed. Given limited resources they need to be really good at that. This is an example of an outsourced service that could be agile and dynamic.

Mr. Guy added the front of the Municipal Services Center should be an inviting community space with tables, chairs, and an area to come together. Mr. Rule stated whether it is the fields, tennis courts, etc. the city needs to leverage their current assets.

Chair Gabriel stated these are good ideas, and they fit under other areas to look at. She said there are also places to look for more outsourcing and shared services, similar to what was done with solid waste. Departments need to be looked at where the employees do not work face to face with the public.

Chair Gabriel stated there can be consideration for both shared services and outsourcing. She suggested the city could develop expertise, for example in the HR function, and then invite other communities to share those services. Mr. Keen advised it is his understanding that most municipalities in the county use an outside law firm to provide legal services. Mr. Gawel suggested they create a list of opportunities the Committee would want to think about. Mr. Keen said the city should periodically run the numbers and see if it works for them to continue the service, and if not, they need to look at alternatives.

Ms. Crane stated staff did a good job with trash, and the 911 call center, and both are difficult things to change.

Examine and recommend specific program areas where a fuller review may be necessary

Chair Gabriel asked if there are other areas that the Committee would like to review.

Mr. Guy questioned the number of programs in the activity guide and if all of the programs offered are being utilized. Chair Gabriel stated they should consider if these programs are covering costs.

Mr. Guy would like to consider conducting a market rate analysis on park facilities, and what could be charged if the city updates facilities. Mr. Gawel wants to replicate the success of the barn, as it is in high demand.

Mr. Guy stated Parks & Recreation provides a fundamental service to the community, and he would like to know if the way UA subsidizes Parks & Recreation is comparable to like cities. Mr. Gawel questioned if there are opportunities the city is missing out on by not using the money in other areas.

Mr. Guy said the city needs to consider partnering with an outside firm to stimulate new ideas for things that would differentiate UA from other communities. Mr. Gawel suggested UA have a unique feature like an outdoor ice skating rink, and social events like first Fridays, which could be funded through public private partnerships.

Chair Gabriel pointed out the recurring theme is leveraging the city's assets as best as possible.

Mr. Guy suggested giving the City Manager some financial support to think out of the box. He stated innovation takes money and it takes risk.

Chair Gabriel would like to get a comprehensive view of the city's capital equipment. She would like formalize a ten year capital equipment plan and update it every year. She suggested an audit to determine what equipment is needed, when it becomes obsolete, and what the maintenance schedule is.

Ms. Crane stated she would like more transparency for the TIFs. Mr. Keen suggested a general assessment of how TIFs are used, when they are used, and if they are being used right. Ms. Crane stated for transparency, it is important to know what is going in, what the city is getting back over time, and if it is meeting expectations.

Mr. Keen suggested Upper Arlington work together with similar cities to advocate for a change in state law for how the municipal income tax works. He stated Upper Arlington is at a big disadvantage by this law.

3. Public Comment

In response to Chair Gabriel's invitation to speak, Mr. Becker stated he feels the city should reach out more to the business base. He would like more attention given to the Tree of Life asset. He stated Economic Development needs to put together a game plan in working with them, it is a very important property and over 30% of our commercial space that can fit up to 800 jobs. Mr. Guy feels that is an opportunity along with the Macy's area. Mr. Becker stated the schools and the city are the largest employers, which is not good because there is no growth there. Tree of Life should be the city's largest employer.

The next meeting is June 13th, Chair Gabriel would like to add meetings on June 20th and June 27th, to develop the bullet points to present to Council.

There being no further business before the Citizen Financial Review Task Force, the meeting was adjourned at 8:39 p.m.

Chairpersor

ATTEST

Assistant Deputy City Clerk



3600 Tremont Road | Upper Arlington, OH 43221 614-583-5040 | upperarlingtonoh.gov

Summary of Privatization & Shared Services

Updated May 23, 2019

The accompanying spreadsheet was created in 2014 and, while it may not provide a full list of shared services and partnership examples since it is now a dated document, it does provide insight into the extent to which City departments work to collaborate with other entities.

Below are other examples of note.

Successfully Implemented/Ongoing

- Solid Waste Services privatized 2008, new contract/service overhaul implemented first quarter 2018
- 911/Dispatching Consolidation transition completed first quarter 2018
- **Fiber Optic Network** installed 2017 as a partnership between the City, Schools and Library.
- School Resource Officers expanded twice, to now include one officer at the High School, one officer at each middle school, and one officer for the elementary schools. The costs are shared with the Upper Arlington Schools.

Explored/Not Implemented/Discontinued

- **Privatization of Pool Operations** 2017. Contract not renewed.
- Clinton Township Joint Economic Development Zone (JEDZ) Proposal First quarter 2013. Clinton Township decided to not pursue this partnership opportunity. Would have entailed a vote of township residents.
- Clinton Township Fire/EMS Services partnership to provide EMS services to Clinton Township was terminated by Clinton Township in 2018.
- Marble Cliff Shared Services Proposal 2011. Marble Cliff historically contracts with Grandview Heights for various municipal services, asked UA to submit a bid. Marble Cliff Council ultimately voted to remain with Grandview.

Under Consideration

- Group of municipalities that are part of COIRS radio system are discussing sharing Records Management System software for police departments.
- Discussing with the Schools the sharing of security system back-end for video monitoring and door access.

Title	Public Purpose	Departments	Description/Partners	Estimated Savings/Value	Annual Total 1 (inc min wage)	Annual Total 2 (inc Ohio vol rate)	1X Total
ITEMS TO WHICH A VALU	E CAN BE ASSIGN	IED					
Fourth of July	Community pride	& Rec, CAO	UACA plans & implements event with City assistance. If not for UACA, City would be responsible for entire event. Fire incurs \$4,000 in staffing costs. Staffing costs also associated for Police, Public Services, Parks & Recreation. Citizen Police Academy Alumni volunteers provide assistance to City.	(pending feedback from UACA) Fireworks - \$60,000 Entertainment/staging - \$20,000 Volunteer hours - 2,000	\$95,900.00	\$118,460.00	
Shared Commercial Plan Examiner	Core services	Building Division	Shared professional service with two Certified Master Plan Examiners to review all commercial building plans prior to approval. Cost to hire full time examiner would be \$90,000. Actual cost through shared service is \$42,500.	\$90,000 - \$42,500 = \$47,500 cost savings	\$47,500.00	\$47,500.00	
Shared Certified Electrical Inspector	Core services	Building Division	Shared professional service with one Certified Electrical Inspector for all electrical installations and alterations for commercial/residential buildings. Cost to employ full time CEI would be \$75,000. Actual cost \$32,166.	\$75,000 - \$32,166 = \$42,834 cost savings	\$42,834.00	\$42,834.00	
Shared Certified Building Inspector	Core services	Building Division	Shared professional service with additional Certified Building Inspector to assist in inspections from all commercial and residential alterations. Cost to employ 3rd CBI would be \$65,000. Actual cost \$30,000.	\$65,000 -\$30,000 =\$35,000 cost savings	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00	-
Volunteer UA	Community engagement	СМО	Host annual volunteer awareness expo for non-profits, coordinated in partnership with 5 entities that assist with planning, logistics, promotions etc. Substitute for having a staff member focused on volunteer activities.	Event planning/promotions - 35 hrs Day of - 70 hrs	\$834.75	\$2,019.15	
UA Insight Newsletter	Community engagement	СМО	Partnership with UA Schools since winter 2013.	City savings - \$9,400 per year Schools savings - \$14,000 per year	\$9,400.00	\$9,400.00	
Wall of Honor	Community pride	CMO, Parks & Rec	Partnership with UA Historical Society. City pays for plaque, does PR, Historical Society coordinates event, pays for refreshments.	Volunteer hours - 50 Refreshments - \$500	\$895.50	\$1,461.50	
CORMA	Organization operations	Finance & Administrative Services	Pooling liability risk insurance coverage with 6 other municipalities.	Need to compare estimated cost of obtaining liability insurance on our own through thrid party			
Other cooperative purchasing arrangements - fleet, equipment, etc.	Cooperative purchasing	Finance & Administrative Services	Information pending.				
Hazardous Materials Response	Safety	Fire	Membership with Northwest Area Strike Team (NAS-T). Saves costs of training and maintaining full complement of Technicians and entry team equipment.	Annual savings \$5,000	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	
Shared Fire Investigation	Safety	Fire	Utilization of resources through NAS-T for fire investigations.	Fire investigation savings - \$500	\$500.00	\$500.00	
Sharing of Hose Testing Equipment	Safety	Fire	Collaboration with Norwich Township fire department on capital cost of hose equipment. They use Fire Safety House.	Savings of \$3,800	\$3,800.00	\$3,800.00	
Group Purchase of Capital Equipment	Cooperative purchasing	Fire	savings per unit.	Heart monitor equipment \$13,000 Breathing apparatus \$97,690			\$110,690.00
Central Ohio Trauma System (COTS)	Safety	Fire	Fire division has gained access to a Bariatric Transport resource (year?).	15,000 equipment savings			\$15,000.00

Title	Public Purpose	Departments	Description/Partners	Estimated Savings/Value	Annual Total 1 (inc min wage)	Annual Total 2 (inc Ohio vol rate)	
Central Ohio Strike Team	Safety	Fire	Regional Collapse rescue response. Total cost of \$4,500 for operational and trainings cost; \$1.5 million received over 12 years: covers 100% of the capital equipment costs.				\$1,500,000.00
Senior Advisory Council	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Assist with planning and implementation of year-round programming at the UA Senior Center.	10,000 hrs	\$79,500.00	\$192,300.00	
Mowing at three library sites	Core services	Parks & Recreation	City now mows grass at the two library sites (Lane & Tremont). @ 15 minutes mow time per cycle.	Library no longer charges us for parking lot lights at Tremont	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	
Custodians at Barrington Summer Camp	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	City has taken on registration for Summer School. Schools changed custodial schedules to avoid overtime costs. No costs for summer camps.	Summer camp custodial savings - \$4,100	\$4,100.00	\$4,100.00	
Snow removal on sidewalks adjacent to Greensview	Core services	Parks & Recreation	School staff clears snow where city staff could not get to in an appropriate time. Varies based on winter weather.	No overtime or scheduled time for this site \$500	\$500.00	\$500.00	
Loan schools ADA pool lift	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Schools do not have to purchase a ADA pool lift for indoor pool.	City uses school indoor pool for no fee during the indoor season	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	
Shared water service	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Use same water service at Reed Rd Water Park/Hastings.	1X construction savings of \$60,000 (2005)	\$200.00	\$200.00	\$60,000.00
Joint Recreation District at Burbank Park	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	City is responsible for: trees, parking lot, restrooms School responsible for: mowing, weed control, fertilization The two entities are able to focus on their strengths, allowing the other to cover areas outside of their expertise 2,000.		\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	
Labor Day Arts Festival	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Includes financial sponsorships, in-kind donations and extensive volunteer hours (based on 2014 event)	Sponsorships - \$19,876 In-kind donations - \$26,000 Volunteer hours - 2,250	\$65,751.00	\$93,951.00	
Spring Fling	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Volunteer assistance with day-off logistics, etc. *-To receive \$5,000 sponsorship from UA Community Foundation in 2015	20 volunteers, 4 hrs each	\$636.00	\$1,538.40	
Easter Candy Hunt	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Civic Association partnership, they provide volunteers/day of assistance.	30 volunteers, 2 hrs	\$477.00	\$1,153.80	
Summer Celebration	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Volunteer assistance with day-off logistics, etc. *-To receive \$5,000 sponsorship from UA Community Foundation in 2015	4 volunteers, 6 hrs	\$190.80	\$461.52	
Fall Fest	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Volunteer assistance with day-off logistics, etc. - To receive \$5,000 sponsorship from UA Community Foundation in 2015	20 volunteers, 4 hrs each	\$636.00	\$1,538.40	
Winter Festival	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Volunteer assistance with day-off logistics, etc. *-To receive \$5,000 sponsorship from UA Community Foundation in 2015	4 volunteers, 4 hrs each	\$127.20	\$307.68	
Recreation Programs	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	Volunteer assistance running various programs.	510 hrs	\$4,054.50	\$9,807.30	
Weed Warriors	Community engagement	Parks & Recreation	Volunteers assist with invasive species removal in UA parks.	200 hrs	\$1,590.00	\$3,846.00	
Franklin County Drug Task Force	Safety	Police	Partnership with other area police departments and the DEA to mititage flow of illegal drugs and organized criminal activity. Shared funding.	Overtime reimbursement - \$17,500	\$24,500.00	\$24,500.00	
DEA Task Force	Safety	Police	Partner with DEA, Westerville, Grove City and Ohio BCI. Tasked to focus on major drug suppliers such as Colombian and Mexican Cartels.	Savings on personnel costs of 1.65 officers - @ \$180,000	\$180,000.00	\$180,000.00	

Title	Public Purpose	Departments	Description/Partners	Estimated Savings/Value	Annual Total 1 (inc min wage)	Annual Total 2 (inc Ohio vol rate)	1X Total
Critical Incident Response Service (CIRS)	Safety	Police	Comprised of volunteers from local agencies across Central Ohio. Used when needed.	Savings on 100 hours of free training for officers	\$2,214.00	\$2,214.00	,
Ohio Defense Reutilization and Marketing Office	Safety	Police	UAPD has received thousands of dollars worth of rifles and gas masks through our membership	Rifle/gas mask savings - \$15,000 Varies, at least \$15,000 per year	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	
Project Lifesaver	Safety	Police	Helping assist those who care for loved one's with Alzheimer's disease and other related mental dysfunction disorders. 1X savings when program implemented (2009). Partnership with UA Commission on Aging.	Equipment Cost Savings - \$15,000			\$15,000.00
D.A.R.E.	Safety/community engagement	Police	Drug abuse prevention/ drug awareness/ drug education. Funding from Ohio Attorney General Office - varies each year. City picks up remainder of costs for officer.	Represents approx .35 officer Typical annual funding -\$37,000	\$37,000.00	\$37,000.00	
UA Citizen Police Academy	Community engagement	Police	Recruit and engage citizens that would be willing to serve as volunteers to assist in our operational needs.	Average of 1,100 volunteer hours per year	\$8,745.00	\$21,153.00	
Internet Crimes Against Children Task Force	Safety	Police		Reimbursable overtime (annual) - \$17,000 Updated equipment (1X) -	\$17,000.00	\$17,000.00	\$47,000.00
Franklin County OVI Task Force	Safety	Police	Provide staffing for check points on a quarterly basis to be eligible to receive overtime funding.	Reimbursment -\$4,000	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	
School Resource Officer	Safety/Community engagement	Police	Officer responsible for the majority of law enforcement activities occurring at the schools during schools hours as well as bridging the gap between police officers and students.	Cost shared between City & School District. 50% of program funded via Police Division Drug Asset funds.	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00	
Safety Town	Safety/community engagement	Police, Parks & Rec, CMO	Long-running summer safety education program for kindergartners, uses volunteers, provided space at no charge by UA Schools. Parks & Rec assists with registration, Commuity Affairs assists with promotion.	Volunteer hours - 174 Facility - \$5,000	\$6,383.30	\$8,346.02	
Fleet Division Preventitive Maintenance and Emergency Services	Core services	Public Services	Provide maintenance and emergency services to neighboring communities: Norwich Township Fire, Grandview Heights Fire. Hoping to add Washington Township Fire.	Average Annual Rev -\$ 44,379.17 Plus reimbursement for parts	\$44,379.17	\$44,379.17	
Ohio EPA Stormwater permit requirements	Core services	Public Services	Collaboration with Franklin Soil & Water Conservation District where they provide some required services. UA has given them \$102,175 but in return we have received programs from them valued at \$155,603. ROI of \$53,428 over 6 years.				\$53,428.00
Boy Scouts Swamp Romp	Community engagement	Public Services	9 years of cleanup effort of our creeks in UA with Boy scout	145 volunteers per year 5 hrs per volunteer	\$5,259.00	\$13,431.00	
					\$809,907.22	\$1,008,701.94	\$1,801,118.00

Title	Public Purpose	Departments	Description/Partners	Estimated Savings/Value	Annual Total 1 (inc min wage)	Annual Total 2 (inc Ohio vol rate)	1X Total
ITEMS THAT HAVE VALUE	BUT ARE HARD	TO CAPTURE IN \$\$					
Shared Case Covering	Organization operations	City Attorney's Office	Work with Groveport Prosecutor - covering cases for each other free of charge. 10 yr agreement, would be charged at \$85 per hr.	No costs and saves money			
Probation Officer stationing	Organization operations	City Attorney's Office	Probabtion Officer stationed at the school one to two days a week executed by MOU.				
P.O. sharing with Columbus	Organization operations	City Attorney's Office	Some cases filed downton will have UA Parole officer serve as the case P.O. As such the individual is obligated to pay UA's probation fee.	Varies			
IMLA List Serve	Organization operations	City Attorney's Office	Legal Research Assistance				
Shared prosecution with Columbus	Organization operations	City Attorney's Office	Agreement with City of Columbus for prosecution on jurisdiction issue cases.	No cost and saves money			
Automatic Aid/mutual Aid	Safety	Fire	One less fire aparatus in North U.A. 6 less personnel each year, 1 less engine/equipment since 1991. Annual cost of approx. \$690,000 if level of service had been maintained.				
High School Footbal EMS coverage	Safety	Fire	City/Schools partnership. Fire provides free EMS coverage at home UA football games at no charge for school system.	Value - \$450/5 games			
STAY-UA	Safety	Fire	Private/public partnership - aimed at safely keeping elderly UA residents in their home while reducing un-necessary emergency room transports. EMS crews can make referral to National Church Residences (current provider) at no charge to City. Program serves 75-100 residents a year.	Savings for City unknown; however, it did save residents \$24,816 in EMS transport fees alone (year?)		728	
Sports Leagues	Recreation	Parks & Rec	Significant volunteer hours, hard to quantify.				
Reciprocated free use of	Recreation	Parks & Recreation	City programs can use school outdoor facilities at no fee.				
city/school outdoor fields			Schools can use outdoor facilities at no fee.				
Central Ohio Regional Enforcement (CORE)	Safety	Police	Plan to share resources (itelligence functions, SWAT, training, major investigations, and Field Force) with police agencies across the county.	Not fully implemented to date; however, this program will allow UAPD to use personnel to assist in these functions should a need			1
Lab Analysis of DNA, Fingerprints	Safety	Police	UAPD transports or sends all evidentiary items such as blood, rape kits, DNA, glass and handwriting to outside labs for analysis.	Exact savings undetermined - no need for in-house chemist or lab technician			
Civic Groups and Organizations	Safety/community engagement	Police	Annual partners with local civic organizations to support/fund programs focused on improving and maintaining safety in UA. Has included: Safety Town - 20 tricycles (UA Rotary), houses (Jenny Renkert/Chuck Nutter 2008) \$10,000; 900 Child ID Kits (UA Rotary); Drug Take Back Days (UA Optimist Club).	Values have varied, hard to capture			
Mutual Aid	Safety	Police	Agreement with surrounding jurisdiction to provide or receive assistance during emergencies or other times of need.	No need for UA to staff, train, equip for SWAT services,			
Upper Arlington City Schools	Safety	Police	Collaborating with UA Schools to obtain a two-way radio used to communicate with appropriate personnel in an emergency situation in any school. City does not pay airway/lease fees.				
Communications Center Consolidation	Safety	Police	Currently exploring the possibility of partnering with other central Ohio police agencies to consolidate dispatching	Potential FUTURE savings			

Title	Public Purpose	Departments	Description/Partners	Estimated Savings/Value		Annual Total 2	
In House Sign-shop	Core services	Public Services	Selling of out dated and non-compliant street name signs. Signs have also been produced for UA Schools.		(inc min wage)	(inc Ohio vol rate)	
Salt Storage Agreement	Core services	Public Services	Use ODOT salt from their facility and store a loader. Money saved is equal to what it would cost to rent out our own facility to store salt.				

NOTES:

Minimum Wage Rate - \$7.95 Ohio Volunteer Rate - \$19.23